

Public schools, social class, and English education: Does English a language of opening opportunity?

Dr. Preeti Oza¹, Dr. Asit Panda², Dr. Vandana Whig³, Dr. Janine Joy L. Tenerife⁴, Dr. Baiju Krishnan⁵

¹*St. Andrew's College University of Mumbai*

²*Assistant Professor, Department of English (UG & PG), Belda College*

³*Professor, Department of Management, TeerthankarMahaveer Institute of Management and Technology Moradabad*

⁴*Instructor Cebu Technological University - Main Campus*

⁵*Assistant Professor of English, Department of Sciences and Humanities, Vignan University, Vadlamudi, Guntur-522213, Andhra Pradesh, India.*

Abstract

Most Latin American countries are enhancing English language lessons in public schools by starting the program earlier and increasing the number of hours of L2 instruction. The popular phrase "English opens doors" captures the cause for this fast spread. It acknowledges worldwide English's apparent ability to improve people's economic and social prospects. Columbia, for instance, doubled the duration of English education in public institutions from three to thirteen years. At first glance, the new initiative seems to be a massive acquisition planning effort intended to level the playing field for working-class Colombians by greatly increasing access to English education and opening new economic opportunities. The author investigates how English teaching varies by social class in schools and considers if English alters the equation for pupils, building on crucial theorists' explorations of schooling and social reproduction. The researcher analyzes how program implementation reality meets and falls short of program aims by using the data in-classroom observation from a research report of the Colombian program's pilot phase in elementary grades and data from interviews with various stakeholders.

Keywords: Educate students in English language, young linguists, Global English, Equity in education, social class, public education, Programs for early language acquisition

Introduction

Ministry of Education has begun a massive new educational effort to broaden English language lessons to the country's 12.5 million public elementary students in grades 1-6. It was striking to see that more than half of parents enrolled their offspring in the new English program. During discussions with groups of parents of learners enrolled in the new English program, many utilized some variation of the phrase "English unlocks many opportunities for oneself" to justify their approval for the

program. The Latin American catchphrase "English opens doors" highlights the projected potential of global English in providing people with increased economic and social changes (Ubillo Daz 2017). Increasing English proficiency in emerging nations is discursively related to worldwide competitiveness and modernity (Sung 2020).

Colombia has historically depended on an elite paradigm of bilingualism, with pupils enrolled in private institutions receiving comprehensive English teaching and attaining higher

competency levels (Cycyk & Hammer, 2020). Consequently, several nations have expanded English language teaching in their public-institution curriculum by starting English instruction earlier and extending teaching time, or by adopting a "more and sooner" method to primary English education (Wang & Kokotsaki, 2018). Colombia is an excellent example of this. The English Teaching Fellowship Program (ETF) is a social initiative that helps bring qualified English teachers to Colombian public schools and institutions with the intent to build a bilingual Colombia. An increase has matched this in teacher recruiting and training expenditures. The new project reflects a broad effort at acquisition planning (Lee et al., 2021) with the goal of "leveling the playing field" for poor and working-class Colombians by considerably boosting access to English education and providing new paths of economic opportunity.

This study will look at how kids in public primary school system use the rhetoric of English Opens Doors in their daily learning. For this research, it drew on previous critical theorists' work on class, education, and social reproduction (Shahamat et al., 2019; Nishioka & Durrani, 2019), as well as more contemporary work in social class and applied linguistics on language (Preece 2018; Kuchah 2018). For working-class youngsters, the essential issue is whether or not English can alter the equation. To put it another way, what opportunities does English provide for social reproduction and/or social mobility, and how do the new public school program's English curriculum and educational procedures promote these?

The qualitative data reported here originate from a larger mixed-methods influence analysis of the program's pilot phase (Pérez-Llantada 2018). This is based on three years of classroom observations and contact with various program stakeholders. It describes the background and peculiarities of program, which is more ambitious than those in other Latin American countries but is symbolic of similar programs. It investigates how the program responds to the inextricable discursive relationship between the demand for English, the socio-economic prospects of individual Colombians, and the country's capacity to participate in the global

economy from a language education policy standpoint. The information is given in the form of two scenarios that depict a common English session for sixth-grade students at two schools with various socio-economic levels, highlighting the contrasts in English instruction's content and methods. The discussion examines the scenes via the theoretical framework's lens, examining how, even though instructors give similar lessons from the same standardized national curriculum, their instructional strategies are characterized uniquely by their students' social class placement. From an applied linguistics perspective, the article addresses how English programs for elementary students in foreign environments should address access, equality, and social class issues.

Early English programs and social class

Instead of using the term "socioeconomic status," it will use "social class" going forward. Students' desire to learn English as a foreign language (EFL) varies widely throughout Chile's socio-economic strata (Fandio et al., 2019), and researchers have used this variation as a predictor in studies of EFL students' motivation (Chater & Christiansen, 2018). The NS-SEC (National Statistics Socio-economic Classification) categorizes workers depending on their jobs. SES is typically measured in educational settings in the United States by an institution's categorization as the number of pupils who get free or minimized lunches, respectively (Sanjurjo et al., 2018). Preece (2018) discusses many techniques to classify workers, from farmers and unskilled manual workers to administrators and professionals.

By contrast, Marxism conceptualizes social class via the lens of property, exploitation, market activity, and supremacy (Jones 2018). An exceptional educational theorist, Jean Anyon, described social class as a web of linkages between many components of society's product, service, and cultural production processes. While one's employment position and level of income help define one's social status, they are not the only factors. Additionally, a person's connections to the structure of physical and cultural capital ownership, the authority structure in society and at the workplace, and the processes and outcomes of professional experiences all contribute (Simandan 2018).

Simandan (2018) argued that education should be tailored to children's career goals depending on their social class status. It defines social class as the ties that bind three components of production: possession, authority, and occupation. It's worth noting that employment plays a significant role in Simandan's 2018 concept of social class rather than income level. The examination of discrepancies in how students are learning throughout socio-economic groups revealed a strong correlation between the instructor's expectations for students' future employment prospects, her/his teaching style, and the sorts of educational experiences offered to children by these techniques (Shahamat et al., 2019; Simandan 2018).

The research, following Simandan (2018) and Preece (2017), demonstrates that social status is a structure that encapsulates learners' social standing (2018). Pierre Bourdieu's groundbreaking book *Distinction* influenced this way of thinking about social stratification: it makes the very good and now generally accepted point that class must be conceptualized. Not only in terms of traditional indexes such as income, occupation and educational attainment but also in terms of status and a range of social practices" (Preece 2018). Critical educational theorists are interested in how education might improve social equality. There is no doubt that academic achievement is significantly related to social class. Can formal education assist working-class youngsters in their upward mobility? This is essentially the same "opens opportunity" issue raised above about English. Schooling is often thought of as a tool for social equality and upward mobility, but critical theorists argue it frequently serves for social reproduction. According to Simandan's (2018) and Kim's (2018) study, working-class children's schools are mostly used to prepare children to follow their parents' footsteps.

Do the benefits of teaching working-class children English in public institutions outweigh the disadvantages of teaching them at a younger age? The correspondence principle refers to how social interactions in the educational system mirror those in the economic system (Kim 2018). According to certain neo-Marxists, education functions as a class-allocating technique, socially generating, conserving, and

reproducing [skills and dispositions] associated with an appropriate social rank" (Deng 2018). More advanced English skills in Latin America are linked to better-paying occupations in the middle class for individuals who went to private schools. English education in Colombian public schools may defy the correspondence principle if it truly opens opportunities and generates new career chances for children who do not come from the same socio-economic class as their parents. This demonstrates the transforming influence of English education as an international language.

Education, language acquisition, and socio-economic status

Applied linguistics has studied the language characteristics of students' engagement with and resistance to a marginalizing educational system. It will go through some of the pertinent material in two categories. First, sociolinguistic and language socialization research shows how socioeconomic status affects access to various linguistic compositions. Second, and most importantly for this research, academics have looked at how students' engagement in language programs is shaped by their social class status, to their benefit or harm.

Access to language repertoires with varying degrees of flexibility

While the academic language was inextricably tied to the values instilled in middle-class children at home, disadvantaged children encountered linguistic demands in the classroom that placed them at a disadvantage. Basil Bernstein, a British sociologist, proposed that part of the reason for impoverished learners' struggles on campus was related to their language, or "code theory." It asserted that the middle-class followed an "extended code," while the impoverished and working-class followed a "limited code" (Deng 2018; 1990). "The code theory asserts that there is a social class governed by unequal distribution of communication privileging principles [...] and that social class, indirectly, influences the classification and framing of the elaborated code transmitted by the school to facilitate and perpetuate its unequal acquisition" (Kim & Wilkinson, 2019; Preece 2018). Many following academics accused Bernstein of proposing a deficit perspective of poor individuals' language

based on his use of the phrases enriched and limited to allude to class-related linguistic inequalities. Bernstein's observation that class disparities are partly due to linguistic differences and that unequal availability of language resources is one element of class discrepancy that impacts students' educational involvement is a significant contribution.

In a recent special edition of the *International Multilingual Research Journal*, another angle on the argument over language and education was revisited (Aichhorn & Puck, 2017). Johnson & Johnson (2021) note that the groundbreaking "Word Gap" research by Kidd et al. (2018) discovered that poor kids are exposed to approximately 20 million shorter words than their wealthier peers by the age of three. As a result, failure to learn the language significantly affects how socio-economic status is seen as a key cause of language inequalities. They believe that the "20 million-word" explanation has gained canonical status in the scientific community and is often quoted as truth by academicians and news organizations. They assert, however, that "singling out minoritized populations' linguistic patterns as insufficient continues to obscure the reality that broad academic issues are historically entrenched and exceedingly complicated."

Sociolinguists who have studied social class have discovered that people of different socio-economic types have varying access to language repertoires (Athanases et al., 2020). That is to say, socio-economic status has a significant impact on language socialization and has substantial ramifications for kids when encountering academic material and language in the institution. It demonstrates how reading behaviors vary along racial and socio-economic lines in three communities in the United States and how each community's cultural logics and values are followed.

Participation in education is organized by language and socio-economic class.

It argues that language socialization in a particular society leads to increasingly illustrious language forms, which is a fairly straightforward statement. It demonstrates that repertoires are cherished differently in an institution. The education system is focused primarily on the literacy activities of middle-class Anglo-

American families, resulting in a specific type of cultural training becoming the institution's standard level of knowledge to the detriment of youngsters from African-American and White working-class societies. Bentez-Burraco and Progovac (2020) look at how instructors use their social positioning to build pupils as more or less effective learners in elementary schools in the United Kingdom. It uses Kim and Wilkinson's (2019) concept of framing to define the management of transmission of information in regards to academic material selection, pace, organization, and assessment. It observes that the instructor and curriculum substantially structure and regulate classroom conversation in conventional pedagogies. Discourse in progressive primary schools in the United Kingdom is often imprecisely constructed, with more excellent learner choice over exercises and perceived influence over learning. Even yet, it observes that instructors' definitions of "excellent learners" are often structured around cultural standards and middle-class speech in student-centered methods.

Hsu's (2017) research of Latino high school ESL learners is noteworthy in the field of TESOL. Inability to learn or resistance to the sorts of sanctioned school actions designed to transition children from limited competence to full competence. English speakers are a rational reaction on the part of the teenagers in Hsu's (2017) research to the marginalization they suffer due to "ESL ghettos, poor teaching, and the isolation of English-language learners in our educational systems," she writes in her study. According to Li and Jiang (2018), a person's social class is inextricably linked to their ethnicity, gender, and immigration status, among other aspects of their social identity (Francis et al., 2019).

In Latin America and Colombia, public elementary English programs are available.

English has been allowed to teach as a second language at the lower secondary level in Colombian public schools, and it is often viewed as a failure (Skarpaas & Hellekjær, 2021). Children in some states began taking English courses as early as kindergarten. During grades 6-9, students typically study three years of English. Still, the quantity and quality of teaching and the number of pupils participating

significantly varied, resulting in many community programs. The Ministry of Education combined local elementary school programs for grades 1-6 into a unified national program by adopting a standardized curriculum, materials, and teaching method. The new project is being progressively expanded to include all 11.3 million elementary school pupils in 90,000 institutions throughout the nation.

Furthermore, mandatory schooling has been expanded throughout middle school and now involves English, resulting in a 300 percent increase in teaching hours over the last several years. As a result, English is currently taught in all elementary and secondary schools. Pupils will get about 1030 hours of weekly lectures throughout 11 years of instruction, as shown to the curriculum's L2 learning trajectory. By the conclusion of ninth grade, students should have advanced from level real beginner to level intermediate in the Colombian curriculum, which is matched with the Common European Framework of Reference (Cocetta 2018) proficiency criteria.

The national program's overall objective is described in the Ministry's English curriculum guideline:

English instruction is integrated across three levels of Basic Education grades K-12 to ensure that learners finish their high school education by the time they finish. They will have obtained the required multicultural and multilingual skills and knowledge better to execute the conversational difficulties of a globalized world, broaden their perspective on the world's cultural and linguistic diversity, and honor their own and other cultures.

The curriculum National Development Plan refers to the "Equal Opportunities" part, which includes the objective of having Colombian people learn language skills to insert themselves into an inconsistent globalized world. It also indicates that the program is a government project to minimize the equality gap among public and private institutions (Wang & Kokotsaki, 2018). Implementing a large-scale, ambitious initiative in a nationwide school system with poor facilities and recurrent budget shortfalls has run into difficulties. The growth has happened in fits and starts, and only about a quarter of the school community is covered,

with rural and indigenous groups experiencing uneven coverage. The most pressing issue has been locating qualified English-speaking instructors. The government estimates that it will need to employ and educate almost 100,000 teachers to properly administer the program and extend it to reach all elementary public-school kids. Cirocki and Farrell (2019) identified implementation challenges in teacher education, salary and contract negotiations, materials, and curriculum improvement.

Methodology

This collection of short stories is based on observations made by the author throughout a two-year analysis assignment in a Colombian state. Specific issues concerning curriculum, resources and training for teachers were of particular interest to the national Ministry of Education Office of English Programs, which commissioned the study. Visits to schools, interviews with parents, learners, teachers, and administrators, and classroom observations comprised the qualitative components of the project. The research team visited 12-15 schools throughout the school year to recruit a random sample of learners and instructors from across the state and analyze how the social environment affects English learning and teaching in public schools. A diverse range of socio-economic, urban, suburban, and rural locations was considered while choosing the schools for the program, including the year the program was launched, whether it was all-day school, morning, or afternoon, and the sort of training obtained by the English instructors. While the interviews were semi-structured, they were also open-ended, allowing for the use of extension prompts and follow-up on unpredicted replies. The procedures were designed to collect similar data across locations; for example, they interviewed all parents with the same basic questions and included a list of characteristics noticed during sessions.

Transcripts of observation notes and audio recordings were made. After conducting interviews in Spanish, the author translated chosen passages into English; the majority of the observations were conducted in English. An inductive and deductive analysis of the information was conducted to identify common

patterns. It re-examined all data coded initially under the theme "SES" for this paper. The two case studies presented below were chosen for their representativeness in illustrating the differences between schools and their accompanying information from interviews (provided in the discussion section following the vignettes), which demonstrated the educators' knowledge and rationale for their instructional methods. According to the Ministry, the socio-economic status of a school was determined and verified in a sample of schools by noting the surrounding neighborhood's housing stock, parents' employment, and instructor resources (e.g., whether they had access to the internet at home or took private after-school language sessions). Schools serve as social class markers, which is essential to consider. Field notes and personal memories are used to fill in details like the sorts of homes built near campus and the prevalence of stray dogs. Details on classroom technology and whether youngsters have glasses or dental braces were chosen to give the reader an idea of standard English classes in Colombian institutions and emphasize the country's specific social class and educational characteristics. Garca (2019) refers to this as "the colonial difference." In this case, the description of a freckled, light-skinned kid at a middle-class Colombian school is an example of this. 3 Students in higher socio-economic status schools are more likely to have freckles, lighter hair, and other physical traits such as glasses and braces.

English as a second language in two different circumstances

School of Middle-class

Escuela Normal Superior El Jardín de Risaralda, such as other urban primary institutions in Colombia, is located in a gated complex in a private neighborhood. Two-story single-family dwellings surround the school, most of which are recently painted and neatly kept. A noble monument of a Revolutionary War leader sits in the well-kept garden beside the principal's office. The enormous metal gate at the entry is painted in a variety of vibrant colors. There are 600 kids in grades 1e6 in the school, divided into three groups of roughly 40 children each.

Ms. Reyes's 6C (fifth grade) classroom has 29 students. All of the children are dressed in the same school uniform. Since physical education

is scheduled, they are dressed in a bright red gym uniform with the institution logo on the breast. Three pupils have braces, and seven have glasses. Most of the students have attended English lessons outside of Jardines; more than half have attended weekend sessions at language centers, and roughly 25% have taken English classes at private institutions before relocating to Jardines. Some of these kids speak rather effectively in English, and some have received certifications for completing intermediate-level international examinations like the Cambridge Movers and Flyers. Several learners have visited the United States and obtained visas.

The classroom's ceiling is hung with a computer projector, and a digital smartboard stands beside the front whiteboard. The walls are adorned with learner's work, a globe map, a billboard depicting the digestive system, and a framed print of Albert Einstein's motivational quote in Spanish, "Great spirits have always encountered violent opposition from mediocre minds." Ms. Reyes has consented to let Jessica, an itinerant English instructor, float some flags with the names of the nations produced by the students opposite the ceiling. These were learners' final outputs for the preceding subject, which asked them to submit a report on an English-speaking nation.

Jessica, an instructor, enters with her roll-a-cart. While Jessica sets up, Ms. Reyes welcomes her and finishes the math session. Jessica welcomes the pupils with, "Good afternoon, students." "Good afternoon, teacher," they all say at the same time. She asks them a series of queries, such as, "How are you today?" "How is the weather today?" says the narrator. "How was your weekend?" it inquires. They all react in unison. Her attention is drawn to a freckled, light-skinned youngster with braces: "What did you do this weekend, Gustavo?" Gustavo flushes and turns to his seatmate for assistance, who yells the Spanish version for him. "I'm going to watch a movie," he finally says—Jessica asks questions regarding the film, as well as the number of pupils who have watched it. "Do you recall our topic?" she asks after a few minutes of discussing movies. What exactly is Unit 3? Read the book to understand what we're discussing. That's correct; it has some spare time. Consider what watching films, playing computer

games, and socializing with friends is all about? Page 28 is right here. Activities to do in your spare time. Let's get started with our presentations. Did you put in any practice time? Have you practiced your leisure time tasks presentation? Are you all set? "Let's see who goes first." She takes a treat stick from her backpack, writes the pupils' roster numbers, then dials Liam and Sophia's numbers. They examine their prepared conversation once more as they make their way to the front, attempting to remember as much as possible. They conduct the role play uncomfortably, periodically gazing at the papers:

Liam: Hello. May I know your name?

Sophia: I am Sophia. How about you?

Liam: You can call me Liam. Can you be my playmate?

Sophia: Sure. Do you want to play volleyball?

Liam: Definitely, I love playing volleyball every weekend.

Sophia: Nice, let us go to the playground.

Liam: No problem, Can I have your cellphone number?

Sophia: 55-23-47-65

Liam: Nice. I will send you a message later or maybe call you.

Sophia: Excellent. Talk to you later.

As the youngsters go back to their seats, their peers cheer. Learners pass in groups of two or three, doing short sketches based on their discourse. Some are muttered, while some incorporate some acting or funny remarks to their classmates' qualities, which receives more applause from the audience. Specific individuals discuss leisure activities that show their social status, like playing computer games at home with a high-speed internet connection or enjoying family trips to the beach. They are given a brief script to read from their notebooks, to which Jessica responds in Spanish. "Why are you reading it?" It must be ingrained in your consciousness. If you want to study English, you must do it in your brain rather than on paper. And yours seems precisely like the textbook; you're recommended to create your conversation based on what you enjoy doing in your spare time, not on what the book says."

School of Working-class

The Escuela Las Lomas is built on a cliff, and the street at the front of the institution is lined

with tiny cinder-block homes with similar layouts. Still, most have been transformed into closet-sized businesses: cobblers, meat traders, and taco stands. An eight-story residential development is located behind the school. The sidewalks are dirty, and numerous brown dogs lie down at the institution's front entrance. The institution includes roughly 635 pupils in grades 1-6, divided into four groups. Metal tables in varying stages of disrepair are crammed into the classrooms.

After lunch, the sixth graders come. The school uniform consists of a skirt for the ladies and grey trousers, a dark blue sweater vest for the guys. Although there are numerous unoccupied tables, none of the 31 pupils in attendance wears braces or glasses, and just a handful of the kids have taken English classes outside of campus, either at language centers or individual sessions. Some of the children stayed after school for a few months last year to study with an English instructor hired by their parents, but he stopped attending, and the courses ceased. Except for John, who was grown in California and began attending the institutions after his parents decided to return to Colombia a few years ago, none of the children had visited the United States. John claims he has lost most of his English since coming to Colombia, but he also claims he doesn't want to confess he speaks English since his students label him a foreigner and force him to assist them with their schoolwork.

A projector is mounted in the ceiling, but the plastic cover and hanging cables indicate that it hasn't been used in a long time. Due to the shared use of the campus building by two groups of students (morning and afternoon), any flyers or pupil artwork posted by one team will be removed or destroyed by the other. The permanent instructor is absent, but instructor Gener, one of three English instructors rotating between groups at the school, comes a few minutes after the pupils. He settles the group and starts the lecture by asking everyone to take out their English notebooks in Spanish. Teacher Gener improvises since many children lack textbooks, either because the Ministry of Education did not provide sufficient volumes to the institution or because they have misplaced theirs. He teaches the same subject on leisure

activities as Teacher Jessica but concentrates on grammar and frequency adverbs.

Teacher Gener hardly teaches directly or even speaks. Rather than that, he has a printout of a grammar paper that he used to learn English throughout his teaching practicum years. He was prepared to educate high school, but the only position available was in a primary institution, where the new English curriculum had begun. He delivers the grammar sheet to a learner in the front seat, who immediately starts copying it on the whiteboard. Gener leans beside the open opportunity, monitoring the learners as they rewrite the information written on the board into their English notes.

Gener interjects while the pupils are writing to stress critical terms. "These are adverbs, remember, since they show frequency," he says in Spanish. Let's have a look at them. "Every now and then...?" Students who have kept up with the class take a break from copying to deliver the translation. The pupils answer *Nunca* when they get to never, and the kid in front of me jabs his classmate by stating, "Ian never make his assignment..." During the session, the only English pupils utilized was this joke. Students in the vicinity who hear the remark giggle, but the instructor doesn't recognize him. Ian answers immediately in Spanish, including an English frequency adverb, and making a disparaging remark about his seatmate's mother. While the others catch up, Teacher Gener teaches the adverbs for a few minutes before resuming his position at the entrance. In front of the class, the student wipes the board clean and starts writing the second half of the grammar sheet. The children write swiftly, and the majority of them seem to have black ink with green or red underlining, uppercase keywords, and emphasize critical information. In 45 minutes, the learner writes and erases the whiteboard four times.

Opening new doors or reopening old ones? mobility and reproductive capacity

With its emphasis on opening opportunities in the workplace and society, English Opens Doors is a powerful argument for its use. As with Colombia's beginning English foreign language program, it requires a large curriculum and faculty development resources investment. Increasing access to English instruction is

justified because graduates with English abilities would find better employment, resulting in increased social equality. Even if English is successfully integrated into the national curriculum, images of English instruction in the middle-class and working-class Colombian institutions imply that this may not be enough. For example, vignettes show that adding English as a new course usually does not alter the essential teaching procedures.

The pedagogy of teachers in most schools was adapted to meet the needs of their pupils. When it comes to transferring information, Kim and Wilkinson (2019) refer to it as a lesson's framing. With this lesson, "power over selection, organization, pace, sequencing, and assessment is situated with [the instructor]" (Benitez-Burraco & Progovac, 2020), an excellent example of framing can be found. Due to a more dispersed distribution of content control, the middle-class Jardines lesson has a poor framing. It is argued by Kim & Wilkinson (2019) that the communicative skills kids learn in school are derived from multi-layered called communication patterns and that they are similar to be class-based. According to Bernstein, the two teachers above's their students' social class does not drive pedagogical approaches. But rather better understood as mechanisms, which the demands of social institutions are exerted to reinforce social stratification in favor of more dominant groups (Deng 2018; Dyson 2019).

The way each instructor described why they taught the way they did was quite eye-opening regarding the classes watched. In an interview following the observation, instructor Gener of the working-class institution described his instruction to Las Lomas pupils as a "back to basics" method, required not by the pupils' poor level of English, but by their total insufficient of educational understanding and abilities required for language learning. Other instructors in working-class institutions mentioned their learners' poor level of Spanish or poor linguistic level as reasons why they needed to focus on grammatical components so they could become more talkative. It questioned Gener in a follow-up interview about how he adapted his teaching to the first group of children who came during the new English program and had

spent five or six years learning the language by sixth grade:

Example 1: The Step-by-step method

- Rennie: How has it impacted your teaching now that children begin learning English in kindergarten or even grade 1 and are expected to have a greater level of proficiency?
- Teacher Gener: Gener: The issue is that they lack many necessary components even when they are in fifth grade. Numerous people have forgotten what a verb or adjective is, and thus the process must be repeated step by step...

Gener's class did not seem to be a good illustration of modern TESOL teaching, nor did it appear to obey the curriculum's approach. He didn't see anything "communicative" in his class (Li 2020). In the interview, he didn't utilize any phrases associated with language instruction based on second language learning principles, such as interaction, engagement, meaning negotiation, understanding, or ideas. He didn't include educational principles such as critical thinking, multiple intelligences, and sociocultural notions such as the proximal development zone. All of which are emphasized in the Colombian teacher's curriculum guide. Gener may or may not have learned these principles during his teaching practicum, but he didn't think they were important to educating sixth-grade students at Las Lomas.

However, it makes sense to consider his approach in the area's socio-economic situation. A big Nissan plant is located in the city. Many Las Lomas people work for Nissan-affiliated enterprises that provide components or the service sector that helps the employees. The majority of these professions need employees to do repetitive tasks properly over long periods of time. Having the mental strength to record a useless list of grammatical rules for 45 minutes continuously, including extra details such as upper-case letters in green ink, might have been beneficial for these positions. Shahamat et al. (2019) portrayed activities in the classroom in working-class institutions as mostly in accordance with the stages of a method, which is often mechanical and requires rote studying behavior and minimal decision-making on the part of the learner, similar to Gener's

class. Because instructors seldom explain why anything is given or related to learning objectives, assignments have no purpose or consistency. Simandan's (2018) study is still valid today, according to Francis et al. (2019), and her categorization of math courses in U.S. institutions was hauntingly the same as the English lectures in Colombia it experienced 28 years later:

A typical aspect of classes at both working-class institutions was that a major amount of what the students were expected to do were processes, the aims of which were sometimes unclear and seemed unrelated to their mental processes or decision-making. One of the fifth-grade instructors demonstrated this sort of education by leading the students through a sequence of procedures to create a one-inch grid on their sheets without informing them of the purpose or that the grid would be used to learn the size. "Take your ruler," she said. Place it on the top. Make a note of each number. Then slide the ruler throughout the page's bottom and write a mark on the top of each number. Write a line from..." "No, you don't; you don't even know what I'm producing yet," the instructor said when one of the students stated she had a quicker method to accomplish it. If you don't do it this way, you're doing it incorrectly" (Simandan 2018).

Working-class children's learning priorities, according to Simandan (2018), are:

Sustaining intellectual or "academic" understanding exists solely on a symbolic level in this case. What seems to qualify as academic knowledge at these two working-class institutions is not knowledgeable in the

conventional sense of ideas, cognitions, facts, or thoughts regarding society, linguistics, arithmetic, or history, all linked by conceptual principles or knowledge of some type. Instead, it appears as though (1) fragmented truths, isolated from context and linked to one another or larger bodies of interpretation, or the students' exercise or biography; and (2) understanding of practical rule-governed behavioral processes by which team performed largely mechanical activities constitute school knowledge in this context.

The lesson in Las Lomas was obviously in contrast to the instruction in Jardines, a trend that was seen in different degrees throughout the

project's institutions. The Jardines pupils were not seen copying anything for beginners, and grammatical structures were not stressed. The kids referenced utilizing smartphone applications and going to shopping malls to indicate their middle-class status in role play. Throughout the post-observation interview, instructor Jessica said she had a part-time job tutoring English in the evenings at a high school. She described it as a "totally different atmosphere" with "many challenges." She explained how she was forced to alter her educating style to accommodate her afternoon pupils:

2nd Example: They are incapable of creating one on their own.

Rennie: So, regarding the distinctions you make between the two situations in which she works, do you believe your teaching method changes depending on whether you're here or at the other school?

Ma'am Jessica: Yes ...

Rennie: How is that?

Ma'am Jessica: Yeah, for instance, in this matter from the school, the researcher had just noticed regarding spare time tasks; I clarified how to convey your like, provided them the components, and communicated regarding what you don't enjoy. They listened to a recorded discussion before I instructed them, "Now create a conversation, chatting about what you like." So, they selected the subject and created their monologues in whichever way they saw fit. And at the other class, I only had to present them the entire dialogue they reproduced.

Rennie: Mmm ...

Ma'am Jessica: Because they are incapable of creating one on their own, it is different.

Rennie: Thus, you're implying that the pupil cannot succeed here on his or her own.

Ma'am Jessica: produce more

Rennie: convey their own interpretation.

Ma'am Jessica: Absolutely. Yes.

Rennie: And in another context, it's as if you're obligated to provide it and do the task for them.

Ma'am Jessica: Yeah.

According to Gener and Jessica's comments, some English class activities, such as correct reproducing and following process, are ideal for students who have not yet grasped critical aspects of their L1 or L2 language. Activities such as conveying one's own interpretations, developing and creating conversations, and replying to open-ended inquiries are suited for those who possess the necessary fundamental knowledge and are therefore prepared for less organized activities. This is demonstrated when Jessica states (Turn 04) that she must bring a full conversation for students at the lower SES

institution to imitate. Yet, she chastised students in middle-class schools for making conversation that was too similar to the discourse in the textbook. For working-class students, learning English entails grasping the language's essential components. The aim of learning English seems to be to remediate language abilities that they did not acquire in their L. Middle-class children, learning English is about "getting it in their heads," rather than depending on what is written in a textbook. As a result, the instructors' explanations for the disparities in their teaching found in the two settings are unrelated to the

English Opens Doors rhetoric but instead represent the "gap" or deficiency perspective of poor student's linguistics (Johnson & Johnson 2021).

Differences in instructors' methods of teaching English to pupils from various socio-economic classes seem to correlate to how the instructors perceive their future prospects. According to Simandan (2018), interpretation of social status as one's connection to the content and delivery of a task performed, instructors' methodologies are predisposed to coincide with their learners' future employment prospects, which is essentially the correspondence principle argument (Dyson 2019). This has a subtle but significant impact on the teacher's perception of the student's motivation for studying English. Learning English becomes more and more like the procedures that will be appreciated in the job. Teachers' expectations are also reflected in these activities. They include rote studying, endurance and repetition, and adhering to mechanical processes for working-class youngsters. For middle-class youngsters, this includes using templates to construct conversations and some creativity and improvising within boundaries. According to Simandan (2018), knowledge is more available for inquiry, invention, and meaning-making in more wealthy schools. Because students are expected to think creatively and independently, it frequently has personal meaning for them.

Discussion

The two lessons selected are representative of a trend seen across the dataset. Working-class English classes were often very structured, with little time for conversation and a big focus on grammatical aspects and notebook writing. On the other hand, students in middle-class schools had weaker framing, utilized less copying, and were more likely to converse, practice L2 abilities, and participate in group tasks. Some deviations were identified with instructors' lessons throughout the institutions, including some lessons that included aspects of both techniques; nonetheless, more than two-thirds of the dozens of classes watched during the experiment followed the class-based pattern. Additionally, other interpretations of the teachings are conceivable. As previously said, the instructors' class-based stance does not

function in isolation from other social forces but rather in collaboration with them. Classroom management and language proficiency were two more issues that instructors came up often throughout the interviews. According to Kim & Wilkinson, lectures with significant structuring, in which the instructor retains tight control over information delivery, are typical in working-class institutions (2019). However, not only how the instructor arranges the kids, but also how she positions herself, may have a role. Many instructors expressed reservations regarding their ability to handle classes since they assumed the homeroom teacher's role and were unfamiliar with the children's names. They indicated that disciplinary issues were frequent in most public institutions, that few teachers had been educated to teach in public elementary schools, and that they were challenged to develop appropriate remedies for misbehaving kids. As a result, lectures like the Lomas one above may be a wise method for instructors to avoid group discipline issues, contrary to group activities and tasks wherein students move about and talk. Another factor to consider is the teacher's personal English proficiency. While most instructors in all institutions had sufficient English competence to deliver lectures mainly in the chosen language, several teachers voiced concerns regarding their English proficiency. By structuring lectures in a more open-ended, communicative manner and allowing students more autonomy, instructors who are less confident in their English abilities face additional language constraints.

One surprising result from interviews with students from various socio-economic backgrounds was that they all described using English in comparable ways outside of school. The majority of children claimed to listen to mainstream music and play computer games in English and utilize social media platforms like F.B., Snapchat, and WhatsApp to communicate with transnational relatives in the United States (Cheung 2021). Working-class students visited affordable cybercafes, but middle-class learners had laptops and network connections in their houses, but the habits were startlingly similar. Although students from various socio-economic classes use English similarly in their daily lives, pedagogical techniques in ESOL classes seem to

replicate social class disparities. As a result, as Francis et al. (2019) point out, class reproduction in schools occasionally falls along the recognized fault lines of race, culture, linguistic groups, gender but easily assumes individual patterns and discursive forms of learner agency. According to Mellom et al. (2018), the consequence is a paper-thin hegemony, constantly disputed and sometimes fragile rather than impenetrable effectiveness of class reproduction. However, the issue of what methodology might succeed in an English class at an institution such as Las Lomas to dislodge the paper-thin dominance that inevitably forces instructors toward a back-to-basics method remains unresolved.

Conclusions

According to Preece (2018), the commodification of English has made global English a communication resource that serves as a barometer of middle- and upper-class status in cultures throughout the globe (Holborow 2018). English's indexical worth in Latin America was well-known to the parents and instructors surveyed for this research, and they wanted to make sure their kids learned adequate English to benefit from it. As stated in the Colombian curriculum document cited above, an attempt is being made to ensure that all citizens "develop the necessary multilingual and multicultural competencies to face the communicative challenges of a globalized world" by bringing English into public schools and incorporating it into the K-12 curriculum. Adopting an "English for Everyone" strategy elsewhere (Hartshorne et al., 2018) in Colombia and Latin America. As argued (Pérez-Llantada 2018), it reflects a change in language rule from elite bilingualism to macroacquisition. It's important to keep in mind that the "effects of the teaching of English in primary schools in providing opportunities and alleviating poverty are taken as self-evident, and the perceived need for English in developing countries is based largely on the construction of the myth of global English" (Lee 2019).

At first glance, this seems to be a constructive struggle to the historical legacy of English instruction in upholding Colombia's present social order, which is built on colonial racial and class connections (Garca 2019). It would

destabilize the correspondence principle's hegemony (Kim 2018) and strengthen English's role as the world's lingua franca (Patro 2018). Additionally, as the characteristics of English courses at two campuses in this research demonstrate, the concept of English Opens Doors is hard to implement in reality. Effective L2 English acquisition for working-class children is not simply a psycholinguistic or a curricular issue of determining the number of hours of teaching required to achieve a certain level of L2 competence for educators. It is essentially an issue of reorganizing pedagogical approaches such that PELT programs are not merely placed into class-based methodologies and concealed curriculum depending on students' social status placement.

The first concern was whether a nationwide English program for early students in Latin American public institutions might alter the equation for disadvantaged students. This study implies that Zoghbor (2018) is correct in his assertion that English programs cannot be dropped into developing nations like aid packages and that they do not help economic mobility in and of themselves. In Colombia, the English program seems to reflect language instruction rules as "remedies aimed at resolving inequitable outcomes of social arrangements without disrupting the fundamental framework that creates them" (Preece 2018). The English program of the Ministry is institutional racism, but not transformative action, as it does not address underlying structural inequities. Instead of establishing new opportunities, early English program generally incorporates language acquisition within already established socially stratified teaching and learning procedures. Instead of promoting social mobility, it may rather worsen societal structures by establishing a façade of equal access to English teaching (Cycyk & Hammer, 2020) while further entrenching the reality of pupils' uneven possibilities for meaningful language acquisition along class lines.

References

Aichhorn, N., & Puck, J. (2017). Bridging the language gap in multinational companies: Language strategies and the notion of company-

- speak. *Journal of World Business*, 52(3), 386-403. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jwb.2017.01.002>
- Athanases, S. Z., Sanchez, S. L., & Martin, L. M. (2020). Saturate, situate, synthesize: Fostering preservice teachers' conceptual and practical knowledge for learning to lead class discussion. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 88, 102970. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2019.102970>
- Benítez-Burraco, A., & Progovac, L. (2020). A four-stage model for language evolution under the effects of human self-domestication. *Language & Communication*, 73, 1-17. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.langcom.2020.03.002>
- Chater, N., & Christiansen, M. H. (2018). Language acquisition as skill learning. *Current opinion in behavioral sciences*, 21, 205-208. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cobeha.2018.04.001>
- Cheung, A. (2021). Synchronous online teaching, a blessing or a curse? Insights from EFL primary students' interaction during online English lessons. *System*, 100, 102566. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.system.2021.10.2566>
- Cirocki, A., & Farrell, T. S. (2019). Professional development of secondary school EFL teachers: Voices from Indonesia. *System*, 85, 102111. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.system.2019.10.2111>
- Cocchetta, F. (2018). Developing university students' multimodal communicative competence: Field research into multimodal text studies in English. *System*, 77, 19-27. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.system.2018.01.004>
- Cyck, L. M., & Hammer, C. S. (2020). Beliefs, values, and practices of Colombian immigrant families towards language and learning in toddlerhood: Setting the foundation for early childhood education. *Early Childhood Research Quarterly*, 52, 25-37. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecresq.2018.09.009>
- Deng, Z. (2018). Contemporary curriculum theorizing: Crisis and resolution. *Journal of Curriculum Studies*, 50(6), 691-710. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00220272.2018.1537376>
- Dyson, J. (2019). Rethinking education as a contradictory resource: Girls' education in the Indian Himalayas. *Geoforum*, 103, 66-74. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.geoforum.2019.03.021>
- Fandiño, F. G. E., Muñoz, L. D., & Velandia, A. J. S. (2019). Motivation and E-Learning English as a foreign language: A qualitative study. *Heliyon*, 5(9), e02394. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2019.e02394>
- Francis, B., Hodgen, J., Craig, N., Taylor, B., Archer, L., Mazonod, A., ... & Connolly, P. (2019). Teacher 'quality' and attainment grouping: The role of within-school teacher deployment in social and educational inequality. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 77, 183-192. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2018.10.001>
- García, O. (2019). Decolonizing foreign, second, heritage, and first languages: Implications for education. *Decolonizing foreign language education*, 152-168. https://books.google.com.ph/books?hl=en&lr=&id=STiDDwAAQBAJ&oi=fnd&pg=PA152&dq=Decolonizing++English++language++teaching+elsevier+&ots=xqJyxqZgFc&sig=2RgWkE15r39463kXzriF_2ggG0g&redir_esc=y#v=onepage&q=Decolonizing%20%20English%20%20language%20%20teaching%20elsevier&f=false
- Hartshorne, J. K., Tenenbaum, J. B., & Pinker, S. (2018). A critical period for second language acquisition: Evidence from 2/3 million English speakers. *Cognition*, 177, 263-277. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cognition.2018.04.007>
- Holborow, M. (2018). Language, commodification and labour: The relevance of Marx. *Language Sciences*, 70, 58-67. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.langsci.2018.02.002>
- Hsu, T. C. (2017). Learning English with augmented reality: Do learning styles matter?. *Computers & Education*, 106, 137-149. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compedu.2016.12.007>
- Johnson, D. C., & Johnson, E. J. (2021). *The language gap: Normalizing deficit ideologies*. Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315561554>
- Jones, P. E. (2018). Karl Marx and the language sciences—critical encounters: introduction to the

- special issue. *Language Sciences*, 70. <http://shura.shu.ac.uk/information.html>
- Kidd, E., Donnelly, S., & Christiansen, M. H. (2018). Individual differences in language acquisition and processing. *Trends in cognitive sciences*, 22(2), 154-169. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tics.2017.11.006>
- Kim, J. (2018). School accountability and standard-based education reform: The recall of social efficiency movement and scientific management. *International Journal of Educational Development*, 60, 80-87. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijedudev.2017.11.003>
- Kim, M. Y., & Wilkinson, I. A. (2019). What is dialogic teaching? Constructing, deconstructing, and reconstructing a pedagogy of classroom talk. *Learning, Culture and Social Interaction*, 21, 70-86. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.lcsi.2019.02.003>
- Kuchah, K. (2018). Early English medium instruction in Francophone Cameroon: The injustice of equal opportunity. *System*, 73, 37-47. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.system.2017.10.001>
- Lee, C. S. (2019). Global linguistic capital, global cultural capital: International student migrants in China's two-track international education market. *International Journal of Educational Development*, 67, 94-102. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijedudev.2019.03.011>
- Lee, H. Y., Hamid, M. O., & Hardy, I. (2021). Characterising language policy and planning in international organisations: ASEAN insights. *Current Issues in Language Planning*, 1-19. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14664208.2021.1965742>
- Li, C., & Jiang, S. (2018). Social exclusion, sense of school belonging and mental health of migrant children in China: A structural equation modeling analysis. *Children and Youth Services Review*, 89, 6-12. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.childyouth.2018.04.017>
- Li, M. (2020). Multimodal pedagogy in TESOL teacher education: students' perspectives. *System*, 94, 102337. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.system.2020.10.2337>
- Mellom, P. J., Straubhaar, R., Balderas, C., Ariail, M., & Portes, P. R. (2018). "They come with nothing:" How professional development in a culturally responsive pedagogy shapes teacher attitudes towards Latino/a English language learners. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 71, 98-107. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2017.12.013>
- Nishioka, S., & Durrani, N. (2019). Language and cultural reproduction in Malawi: Unpacking the relationship between linguistic capital and learning outcomes. *International Journal of Educational Research*, 93, 1-12. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijer.2018.09.008>
- Patrão, A. (2018). Linguistic relativism in the age of global lingua franca: Reconciling cultural and linguistic diversity with globalization. *Lingua*, 210, 30-41. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.lingua.2018.04.006>
- Pérez-Llantada, C. (2018). Bringing into focus multilingual realities: Faculty perceptions of academic languages on campus. *Lingua*, 212, 30-43. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.lingua.2018.05.006>
- Preece, S. (2018). Identity work in the academic writing classroom: Where gender meets social class. *Journal of English for Academic Purposes*, 32, 9-20. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jeap.2018.03.004>
- Sanjurjo, J. F., Blanco, J. M. A., & Fernández-Costales, A. (2018). Assessing the influence of socioeconomic status on students' performance in Content and Language Integrated Learning. *System*, 73, 16-26. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.system.2017.09.001>
- Shahamat, H., Nadimi, H., Gharehbaglou, M., & Keramati, E. (2019). An analysis of the motivating factors underlying the hidden curriculum components through the lens of the Iranian students of architecture: A qualitative study. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 86, 102841. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2019.05.007>
- Simandan, D. (2018). Rethinking the health consequences of social class and social mobility. *Social Science & Medicine*, 200, 258-261. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.socscimed.2017.11.037>
- Skarpaas, K. G., & Hellekjær, G. O. (2021). Vocational orientation—A supportive approach to teaching L2 English in upper secondary school

vocational programmes. *International Journal of Educational Research Open*, 2, 100064. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijedro.2021.100064>

Sung, C. C. M. (2020). Investing in English-mediated practices in the EMI university: The case of cross-border mainland Chinese students in Hong Kong. *Lingua*, 243, 102919. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.lingua.2020.102919>

Toledo-Sandoval, F. (2020). Local culture and locally produced ELT textbooks: How do teachers bridge the gap?. *System*, 95, 102362. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.system.2020.102362>

Ubillo Díaz, V. (2017). Social representations underlying the motivation to learn English in students of public vocational technical and private schools. <https://repositorio.uchile.cl/handle/2250/143263>

Wang, L., & Kokotsaki, D. (2018). Primary school teachers' conceptions of creativity in teaching English as a foreign language (EFL) in China. *Thinking skills and creativity*, 29, 115-130. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tsc.2018.06.002>

Zoghbor, W. S. (2018). Teaching English pronunciation to multi-dialect first language learners: The revival of the Lingua Franca Core (LFC). *System*, 78, 1-14. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.system.2018.06.008>